

Historic Preservation Board Regular Meeting

Minutes – September 1, 2015

Present: Chris Endreson, Scott Wolford, Troy Reynolds, David Bailey, Jon Schler and Jody Motz

Not Present: Jodi Coleman-Niernberg and Kevin Reimer

Also Present: Kristen Ashbeck, City Community Development; Shelly Dackonish, Office of the City Attorney

Public Present: Timothy and Jackie Stoffer, 710 Ouray Avenue; Teddy Jordan, 440 North 7th Street; and Joe Hatfield, 407 North 7th Street

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 pm at City Hall by Chair Endreson.

Minutes of June 2, 2015 Meeting. Jodi Motz made a motion to approve the minutes of the June 2, 2015 meeting as written. The motion passed unanimously (6-0) on a second by Jon Schler.

Public Hearing – Certificate of Appropriateness Application. Kristen presented the application by owners Timothy and Jackie Stouffer to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness. The request is to build a raised deck over the existing concrete patio that is under the existing pergola and add access to the new deck by converting existing windows to French doors on the west side (facing 7th Street) of the existing house at 710 Ouray Avenue.

Currently, there is a pergola attached to the west-facing façade with an at-grade concrete slab underneath it. There is a band of four, nine-over-one windows on the wall above the concrete slab. The upper sash of each window has a mullion grid that creates the 9 panes. The owner is proposing to construct a wood-composite deck over the existing concrete slab. The deck will be raised to the floor level of the interior of the home (approximately 37 inches from ground level) and have a staircase off the north side of it. The deck and stairs will have a 36-inch railing of materials that match the railing on the existing kitchen porch off the north-facing façade (wooden posts and rail with aluminum bars). Secondly, the owner is proposing to replace the two inner windows in the band with a set of French doors to access the new deck.

Kristen stated that the only section of the Zoning and Development Code regulations that apply to the deck or the window replacement proposal is Section 21.03.040(g) that outlines the bulk standards in the Residential 8 zone district. The required front yard setback of 20 feet from both North 7th Street and Ouray Avenue applies to the deck. The applicants' Site Plan show a setback off 22.5 feet so the proposal meets this requirement of the Zoning and Development Code.

Ms. Ashbeck then discussed the sections of the North Seventh Street Historic Residential Guidelines and Standards that apply to the proposal. The residence at 710 Ouray Avenue is considered a contributing structure in the District.

Section VI.4.a. Landscaping, states that Property owners should maintain and enhance historically appropriate landscaping in front yards and park strips. The applicant has stated that there is an existing hedge on the west side of the proposed deck that will be retained and will screen much of the view of the deck and the proposed new door. Proposal meets this standard provided the hedge remains.

Several standards in Section VII.6. apply to the deck and new entry:

- 2) The ground plane of any new entry platform or stairs shall stand no higher than one-half a story from the base of the structure. The proposed deck height is approximately 37 inches from the ground plane which is less than on-half a story. Proposal meets this standard.
- 4) Buildings entrances shall be maintained in their historical location. The existing historic primary entrance to the home will remain which faces Ouray Avenue. The proposed new door will be a secondary entrance. Proposal meets this standard.
- 5) Doorway materials and design shall be consistent with the architectural style of the building. The applicant is proposing the new French doors to be wood or wood-like and glass with mullions on the upper glass to match the historic window design. If the Board decides the window replacement is acceptable, the doorway materials and design will meet this standard if wooden doors with proposed mullions are specified.
- 6) Door cases shall be designed with depth and visual relief. The proposed door casing will be consistent with the depth and visual relief that is present in the existing band of windows.

Section VII. includes the following standards for windows.

- 1) Window shape, alignment and style shall be protected to preserve the building's historic character.
- 2) Window materials shall be maintained in a historically accurate manner.
- 3) Any alteration of window shall maintain the historic pattern of their vertical and horizontal rhythms.
- 4) Openings shall not be enlarged, closed off or otherwise altered in form.

The historic band of existing windows will be interrupted by putting in a doorway where the two middle windows are. However, the applicant is proposing to retain the two end windows with the intent to maintain as much original material as possible. In addition, the applicant is proposing that the upper part of the door have mullion grids that would match the existing windows and the lower part of the door will be wooden. The existing hedge that is proposed to be retained will screen the view of the lower part of the proposed door. The existing hedge will screen the lower part of the proposed door. Thus, by appearance from the street, the overall window shape, alignment, style, materials and horizontal rhythm style will meet these standards.

Kristen stated that staff finds that the deck proposal meets the requirements of the Zoning and Development Code and the North Seventh Street Historic Residential District Guidelines and Standards and recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Timothy Stouffer, owner of the property at 710 Ouray Avenue addressed the Board concerning their request. He stated that they had purchased the home 2 years ago and have been restoring/upgrading it since then. Their primary objective is to keep the character of the home in its existing Frank Lloyd Wright prairie style bungalow. Mr. Stouffer sees the existing pergola as an architectural extension of the home that brings balance to its front façade that faces Ouray Avenue. The space under the pergola that has an existing concrete slab that is not directly accessible from the house. Through construction of the raised deck and replacing 2 of the windows with French doors that will be constructed in the style of the home, this outdoor space will become a useable part of the home.

David Bailey stated that on several properties in the District, vegetation hides the architecture of the home and asked the applicant what the proposal would look like without the hedge. Mr. Stouffer replied that you would be able to see the deck and stair supports although they would be dark in color and would blend in with the darker paint color that exists around the base of the exterior walls.

Chairman Endreson then opened the hearing to public comment. Teddy Jordan, 440 North 7th Street, stated that the property should then be addressed off of North 7th Street rather than Ouray Avenue.

Chairman Endreson closed the public comment and invited Board comment on the proposal. Jodi Motz noted, and Board members all agreed that the applicant had done extensive work to provide information for review. Jon Schler stated that the proposal was well thought out and was certainly a reversible modification to the home. The intent to provide a useable outdoor space made a lot of sense. David Bailey added that it was nice to have the architectural drawings to clearly illustrate the proposal.

David Bailey made a motion: Mr. Chairman, on item COA-2015-322, an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed new deck and replacement of windows with French doors at 710 Ouray Avenue, I move we approve the proposal as presented but with the following conditions:

1. The existing hedge on the west side of the pergola be retained and maintained in such a way as to provide maximum screening of the view of the new deck and doorway from 7th Street and Ouray Avenue.
2. The two end windows shall be retained in place and as is in opening size, shape, style and materials.
3. The new doors shall be wooden with the glass in the upper part of the doors matching the height, width and mullion grid as that on the existing end windows to be retained. The lower part of the doors shall also be wooden.

The motion passed unanimously on a second by Jon Schler (6-0).

Discussion and solicitation of comment on proposed Programmatic Agreement. Ms. Ashbeck explained the background and purposed for the Programmatic Agreement. The Agreement has been made available to the public and several entities noted the advertisement and Kristen provided a copy of it to one interested citizen. The advertisement stated that this meeting of the Board is one opportunity for the public to comment on the agreement.

The City of Grand Junction receives approximately \$375,000 in Federal Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funding each year. The funding is then granted to community non-profit agencies or the City of Grand Junction for projects and services that benefit low and moderate income persons, families and neighborhoods. Use of these funds to make improvements to buildings or sites, requires that the City comply with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966. Compliance involves the review of each activity by the Colorado State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO) in order to ensure that there is no adverse impact on properties included in or eligible for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places (historic properties).

The City has determined that implementation of the CDBG program often includes activities such as rehabilitation, energy efficiency retrofits, weatherization, emergency home repairs, demolition and new construction. However, many of these activities have limited potential to affect historic properties. Therefore, the City is proposing to execute a Programmatic Agreement between the City and the SHPO in order to streamline the historic review of such activities. The Agreement will essentially exempt certain activities from further consultation with the SHPO, Indian Tribes and the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation. A detailed listing of the activities to be considered exempt is included in the Agreement but Kristen gave a couple of examples of the types of projects where the Programmatic Agreement would help streamline the historic review of the properties such as on modifications to buildings that are less than 50 years old (Community Homeless Shelter) and minor exterior or interior modifications such as replacing swamp coolers or hot water heaters (Housing Resources of Western Colorado emergency repair program) or repairing roofing (Grand Valley Catholic Outreach).

Chair Endreson invited public comment on the proposed Programmatic Agreement. Timothy Stouffer stated that everyone needs to be accountable for actions such as this one regarding historic preservation but there is some limitation when it comes to rubber stamp activities. He suggested that the process is improperly sized for many of the activities discussed – why would anyone in Washington D.C. have concern over the replacement of a swamp cooler on a home in Grand Junction? This agreement provides a way of streamlining bureaucracy.

Jackie Stouffer is presently a director of a non-profit organization and understands the need for streamlining a process in order to get grant funds to the entities in a timely manner.

David Bailey reiterated that when it comes to grants and funding, recipients want the money quickly and on a timely basis and this agreement will provide some of that for these grants.

Jon Schler asked if this was something that could have been taken care of through the Certified Local Government designation. Ms. Ashbeck was not certain but assumed since other

communities that are designated Certified Local Governments also have such Programmatic Agreements in place that it is a separate concern since this involves a different Federal Agency (Department of Housing and Urban Development – HUD).

The Board asked for clarification on the process for adoption. Shelly Dackonish, Office of the City Attorney responded that the Board could make a motion regarding its support for the Agreement and that the Mayor would be the appropriate signatory for the document.

Jon Schler made a motion to support the Programmatic Agreement between the City of Grand Junction and the Colorado State Historic Preservation Officer as drafted applicable to the City's use of Department of Housing and Urban Development funding. The motion passed unanimously on a second by David Bailey (6-0).

Letter of Support for First Church of Christ, Scientist Grant Application. Kristen explained that the Church is in the process of writing a grant application to the State Historical Fund to refurbish the windows of the Church. There was some discussion about whether the existing coverings over the windows were Plexiglass or Lexan but it wasn't known for certain, either one describes the material. Jody Motz made a motion to approve the letter as written. The motion passed unanimously on a second by Troy Reynolds (6-0).

Other Business. Scott Wolford asked if anyone else had noticed the new townhomes that had been constructed near 10th Street and Colorado Avenue and wondered why the Board had not been consulted regarding the design. Kristen explained that these types of development projects do not require input from the Board and do not require a public hearing. Property owners within 500 feet are notified of the proposed project. The new townhomes did meet the design standards for the Residential Office (RO) zone district and the Transitional area standards in the Greater Downtown Plan which had been developed over a period of 6-7 years. Shelly Dackonish stated that the Board could request advisory review of some activities within areas of the City or for historic resources. The Board would like to discuss its options at a future meeting. Kristen will provide the Board with excerpts from the Code and the Downtown Plan as some background to the discussion.

Jon Schler asked about the status of the historic jail. The last time Kristen had talked with Mesa County, they were gather estimates for restoration/reuse of the building. Troy Reynolds said that his firm had provided estimates for demolition and, to restore it for some use, ADA access was a problem. Chris Endreson asked staff to follow up with Mesa County to see if there has been any recent activity.

Scott Wolford made a motion to adjourn the meeting which was seconded by Jon Schler. The meeting was adjourned at 6:05 pm.