

Historic Preservation Board Regular Meeting

Minutes – October 21, 2015

Present: Jon Schler, Scott Wolford, Troy Reynolds and Jody Motz

Not Present: Jodi Coleman-Niernberg, David Bailey and Christopher Endreson

Also Present: Kristen Ashbeck, City Community Development; Shelly Dackonish, Office of the City Attorney

Public Present: Ron Parron and Mindy Baumgardner

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 pm at City Hall by Jon Schler.

Minutes of September 1, 2015 Meeting. Troy Reynolds made a motion to approve the minutes of the September 1, 2015 meeting as written. The motion passed unanimously (4-0) on a second by Scott Wolford.

Public Hearing – Certificate of Appropriateness Application. Kristen presented the application by prospective buyers Ron Parron and Mindy Baumgardner to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness. The request is to add a detached garage, remove a back porch and replace it with an addition, re-roof the existing house and historic garage, and revise fencing on the property at 621 North 7th Street.

Currently, there is a single family house with a finished, enclosed back porch, a historic garage and a freestanding pergola on the property. The applicant is proposing to construct a new 20' x 25' detached garage on the property between the house and the historic garage that will be retained. In addition, the existing back porch would be removed and replaced with an addition of the same size (98 square feet, 7' x 14') to the back of the home to provide additional kitchen space and a heated laundry area. The detached pergola will be made smaller in order to make room for the new garage. The existing 6-foot wooden privacy fencing will be changed to accommodate the entrance to the new garage off the east-west alley. The house and historic garage will be re-roofed along with the new roofing on the addition and the new garage.

Kristen stated that the only section of the Zoning and Development Code regulations that pertain to the new detached garage is Section 21.03.040(g) that outlines the bulk standards in the Residential 8 zone district that underlies the Planned Development zoning of the North Seventh Street District. The required setback from the alley for the addition is 5 feet. The proposed new garage must be 3 feet from both alleys and the side property lines. However, the Greater Downtown Plan allows accessory structures such as the garage to be located at property line along an alley as long as the eave does not overhang the alley so the proposed garage will meet the required setbacks.

Ms. Ashbeck then discussed the sections of the North Seventh Street Historic Residential Guidelines and Standards that apply to the proposal. The residence at 621 North 7th Street is considered a contributing structure in the District.

Section VI.9 pertains to the fencing and states that fencing should be 60-100% opaque and may be placed on the property line. The applicant is proposing remove some fencing along the alley

for the garage and proposed to repair the remainder of the 6-foot privacy fencing and will meet this guideline.

Section VII.2. pertains to building proportion mass and form and states that new buildings shall use massing and form similar in scale and massing as other accessory structures in the district. The proposed new detached garage will be similar in scale and massing as other accessory structures in the district therefore the proposal meets this standard.

Section VII.3 of the Guidelines and Standards addresses orientation and lot coverage in several standards:

a. Accessory dwelling units, accessory buildings, and garages shall be subordinate to the primary residential building on the site by placing the structure to the rear of the lot.

f. Garages shall not be constructed as part of the primary building. Garages shall be accessed from the alley.

Kristen stated that the proposed new garage is sited on the rear of the lot, is not part of the primary building and will be accessed from the east-west alley along the south side of the property so the proposal meets these standards.

Section VII.5 includes the following standards for exterior materials.

a. Exterior wall materials shall be those that are commonly present in the District.

b. The predominant texture of the new building shall be consistent with the texture of historic materials in the District.

c. Allowable siding materials for new construction include, but are not limited to, wood, painted composite wood-resin or fiber cement siding.

The siding and texture of the proposed addition and the new garage will match the existing materials of the house which are common within the District – 5-1/2” lap wooden siding on the addition and upper part of the garage and wooden shake shingles on the lower part of the new garage to match the house. The proposal will meet these standards.

The following standards in Section VII.8 apply to this proposal regarding Windows and Façade Treatment.

1. Window shape, alignment and style shall be protected to preserve the building’s historic character.

2. Window materials shall be maintained in a historically accurate manner.

The proposed windows will have a similar appearance to the large windows that currently exist on the porch. The applicant is proposing wood-framed Andersen windows in an awning style

consistent with the age of the house (1902). The proposed addition on the back of the house will look basically the same as the current porch except with better construction and materials. Thus, the proposal meets these standards.

Section VII.9 includes guidelines and standards regarding roof forms and materials. Those pertinent to this proposal are:

GUIDELINES

- a. The roof on a new building should relate to the overall size, shape, slope, color, and texture of roofs on adjacent sites or in other areas of the District.

- c. The majority of the roof should be of a pitch of 6:12 or greater. Shed roofs may be appropriate for some porch additions.

STANDARDS

- a. Materials on a new roof or replacement roof shall be similar to materials found on roofs in the District.

The applicant is proposing an 8:12 roof pitch on the new garage and the roof on the addition will be a shed roof as exists on the enclosed porch. The proposed roofing material to re-roof the house and historic garage and roof the addition and the new garage will be asphalt shingles as currently exist on the house, historic garage and enclosed front and rear porches. The proposal meets these guidelines and standards.

Finally, Section VII.11 of the Guidelines and Standards includes guidelines pertaining to additions.

- a. Additions should not exceed 35 percent of the gross square footage of the principal structure and not be visually prominent from North 7th Street.

- d. The height of the addition should not exceed the overall height (roof peak) of the original structure.

- e. The materials used for additions should be similar to materials used in the original construction.

The addition will be no larger and no higher than the existing enclosed porch and the proposed exterior materials will match the siding of the house so the proposal meets these guidelines.

Kristen stated that staff finds that the proposal meets the requirements of the Zoning and Development Code and the North Seventh Street Historic Residential District Guidelines and Standards and recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Jon Schler then opened the hearing to public comment but, seeing no public present, opened the item for Board discussion and questions of the applicant.

Troy Reynolds asked about the location of the tree along the property line that was referred to as a “weed Tree” by the applicant that may need to be removed. Ron Parron, the applicant provided a picture of the tree and City Attorney, Shelly Dackonish requested that it be shown to the entire Board.

Jon Schler stated that the applicant did a good job of working with a very small lot to site the improvements to the property. He also asked if any of the neighbors had provided any input. Kristen replied that Joe Hatfield, who resides at 407 North 7th Street had visited the Community Development office to review the proposal and did not indicate any concerns except maybe the backing space into the east-west alley since the property owner on the south side of the alley also parked in that vicinity on their property.

Troy Reynolds was concerned with the pitch of the shed roof of the proposed addition and it may not be able to meet building code requirements to be a shingled roof. After some discussion with the Board and the applicant, the Board felt there could be a condition of the approval to provide some flexibility with the proposal to be able to meet Code if needed. The applicant concurred with this conclusion.

Jody Motz made a motion: Mr. Chairman, on item COA-2015-432, an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed garage, addition, fencing and re-roofing at 621 North 7th Street, I move we approve the proposal as presented but with the condition that the applicant be allowed to do whatever is needed to the slope of the roof of the addition so that it can be a shingled roof.

The motion passed unanimously on a second by Troy Reynolds (4-0).

DOE Briefing. Kristen stated the Department of Energy is in the process of designating the DOE compound on the National Register and is proposing to restore the original log cabin on the property to be used as visitor center. A representative of the DOE has asked Kristen to visit with the Board about the proposal. The Board briefly discussed and decided, since the property is not in the City limits, it would be good to do a joint meeting with the DOE and the Mesa County Historic Preservation Board. Kristen will follow up with Mesa County to see if something could be arranged in the future.

November 2015 Meeting. Since this special meeting was held late in October, it was decided there would be no regular meeting in November but the Board will convene a regular meeting in December 2015.

Jody Motz made a motion to adjourn the meeting which was seconded by Scott Wolford. The meeting was adjourned at 6:00 pm.