

# AGENDA

**Historic Preservation Board** 

Tuesday, April 3, 2018 <mark>5:30 pm</mark> Hearing Room – City Hall 250 North 5<sup>th</sup> Street

#### \*\*\* NOTE CHANGE OF TIME AND LOCATION ABOVE \*\*\*

- 1 Minutes of March 6, 2018 Meeting (attached)
- 2 Designation in Historic Sites Structures and Districts Expansion of Lincoln Park Historic District (staff report attached)

#### 3 2018 Activities

- Historic Preservation Month (May) Museum Events, CLG Presentation, Designation of Lincoln Park District at May 2, 2018 Meeting, Historic District Walking Tour
- Most Endangered Places Nominations Due August 20, 2018
  - Indian School
  - Tunnel Town Site possible field trip?
- Historic Preservation Pub Crawl (October 5<sup>th</sup> or 6<sup>th</sup>)
- Hawthorne and/or Washington Park Walking Tours in Conjunction with Community Streets Event – October 13<sup>th</sup>

#### **Historic Preservation Board Regular Meeting**

Minutes – March 6, 2018

Present: Chris Endreson, Jody Motz, Ron Parron, Greg Gnesios, Troy Reynolds and Brandon Stam Not Present: David Bailey Also Present: Kristen Ashbeck, Community Development

The meeting was called to order at 4:00 pm at City Hall.

**Minutes of February 6, 2018 Meeting.** Ron Parron made a motion to approve the minutes of the February 6, 2018 meeting as written. The motion passed unanimously (6-0) on a second by Jody Motz.

#### **Review of Proposed Lowell Village Townhomes (R-5 block)**

Kristen provided the Board with background regarding review of this development proposal. While this property is within the North Seventh Street Historic Residential District, the adopted guidelines and standards are applied to the property as advisory only. A Certificate of Appropriateness review is not required but the Board may review the proposal to provide suggestions to the developer relative to the guidelines and standards. The Board referenced proposed plans for the development, a project report that summarizes the proposal and the pertinent sections of the guidelines and standards that had been provided to the Board.

The proposal at this time is development of 36 townhomes on the vacant area of the block. Detached garages are proposed on most of the lots and the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor of the garage could be developed as an Accessory Dwelling Unit. Proposed amenities on the site include garden areas, a greenhouse, recycling and composting collection, a pedestrian plaza and an event space. Brandon Stam added that the school is not a part of the present proposal. There are parameters in place in the Downtown Development Authority (DDA) contract with the developer that stipulate at what time the school would be transferred to the developer. The Juniper Ridge charter school currently occupies the building.

Board discussion included the following topics and comments:

1. Suggest the developer review the attached excerpts from the North Seventh Street Historic Residential District Guidelines and Standards. While they apply as advisory only to this property, they are an excellent reference for the preferred overall character of streetscape, site development, architectural design as well as architectural details for all properties within the National Register District, including this entire site.

2. Appreciate that the front lawn is generally being maintained; however, suggest the garden on the prominent corner of 7th and Grand be relocated since the area will be void of vegetation for much of the year. It is felt that this is a gateway intersection into downtown and also the Historic District and this proposed use does not fit well in that context.

3. Prefer the character depicted in the elevation drawings with emphasis on the following elements which are consistent with the Guidelines and Standards:

- steep, pitched roofs (guidelines and standards specify 6:12 or greater)
- pronounced windows in horizontal bands, 2 story massing
- horizontal siding, gables facing street, front porches

Historic Preservation Board Minutes / March 6, 2018 / Page 2

4. Appreciate that exterior materials of townhomes don't match the historic school but some use of brick on façade (e.g. wainscotting on front facade) would be appropriate. Would appreciate a material and color pallet to better understand the intent.

5. Façade materials should not include any modularity, no aluminum and no stucco as these are not consistent with the Guidelines and Standards nor the overall character of downtown historic homes.

6. The Board would like to see some response in that the developer has done due diligence and at least reviewed the Guidelines and Standards and these comments and see the architectural design follow-up such as drawings from the new architect rather than those presented which, the Board understands, were developed by an architect previously working on the project.

Kristen will provide these comments along with those of other review agencies to the developer.

**Letter of Support – Lowell School Historic Structure Assessment.** A draft letter of support had been included in the Board packet for review. The Board accepted the letter as written. Kristen will provide it to the DDA to include in its application.

**2018 Board Activities.** Based on the discussion at last month's meeting, the Board reviewed the activities that had been suggested.

- Historic Preservation Month (May) Museum Events, CLG Presentation. 7<sup>th</sup> Street Walking Tour Kristen will get a list of Museum events from David Bailey and include in a City press release. The Board would still like to have a presentation by the State regarding Certified Local Government (CLG) process and benefits. Earlier in May would be best. Kristen will look into possible dates for State staff to visit.
- **Historic Preservation Pub Crawl (October 5<sup>th</sup> or 6<sup>th</sup>).** Kristen stated that, in speaking with the City Attorney, the Board may work on the organization of and attend this event but that it was not recommended that the Board actually sponsor it. We will work with David Bailey on it.
- Hawthorne and/or Washington Park Walking Tours in Conjunction with Community Streets Event October 13, 2018. Kristen had discussed this with Kathy Portner, staff to the Urban Trails Committee. It could be an added activity to the event that will be in its second year. It would be good to include the neighborhood associations in the event.
- Most Endangered Places Nominations Due August 20, 2018. The Board will continue to look into a couple of sites for potential nomination: the Indian School or the Tunnel, Colorado town site.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:10 pm.



## HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD AGENDA ITEM

| Project Name:   | Lincoln Park Historic District Expansion                              |
|-----------------|---|
| Applicant:      | Lincoln Park Neighborhood Association                                 |
| Representative: | Elizabeth Rowan   |
| Address:        | 12 <sup>th</sup> to 15 <sup>th</sup> Street, Gunnison to Grand Avenue |
| Staff:          | Kristen Ashbeck, Senior Planner                                       |
| File No.        | HIS-2018-161  |
| Date:           | April 3, 2018   |
|                 |   |

#### I. SUBJECT/SUMMARY

Consider a request by the Lincoln Park Neighborhood Association to designate an expanded area of the Lincoln Park Historic District in the City Register of Historic Sites, Structures and Districts (City Register) and make a recommendation to City Council. The amended District would include five more blocks containing 58 properties adjacent to, and south and east of the existing District.

#### **II. BACKGROUND**

City Council adopted Section 21.07.040, Historic Preservation, in the Zoning and Development Code in 1994 which established a City Register of Historic Sites, Structures and Districts, to which eligible historic resources may be designated. The criteria by which the Historic Preservation Board and Council shall review a proposed designation are specified in the ordinance and are included in the Analysis section of this report.

The purpose and effect of designation is:

- To assist local interests in preservation of physical structures, sites or districts and to recognize locally significant structures, sites or districts;
- To provide a mechanism to educate the public on local history, development of the community, architectural styles and housing and business development;
- To enable the owners of the property in the City to take advantage of historic preservation programs and opportunities; and
- To make all properties listed on the City Registry eligible for such incentive programs as may be developed.

In 1995 an historic survey of the homes in this neighborhood was conducted by the Museum of Western Colorado. At that time, it was recommended by the Museum, working with History Colorado that a four block area between 12<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> Streets and Gunnison and Ouray Avenues that encompassed the large homes bordering Lincoln Park (including a mix of Tudor, English/Norman, Colonial Revival and Spanish Revival) be placed on the National Register of Historic Places. The significance of the four block area is due the higher style architecture, the larger size of the homes and the merchants

and professional residents that lived there. Some of these large homes include stucco surfaces, curved corners with curved windows, and roof terraces. The existing Lincoln Park Historic District was designated in 1997 that encompassed this four-block area. The residents in the area at the time elected to seek local designation rather than National Register due to the timing that was required to pursue national designation.

The Museum survey also recommended that a local historic district surrounding these homes be formed. The proposed expansion of the Lincoln Park Historic District includes a portion of the larger area determined to be eligible for the City Register.

The Lincoln Park neighborhood (named for the adjacent 42-acre city park) consists of the Dundee Place subdivision created in 1909 and the Lincoln Park Addition in 1925. The growth of this area, east of the original square mile, reflected the prosperous times of the Grand Junction community during that period. Many of the people who constructed and/or lived in these homes were successful merchants and professionals who played important roles in the history of Grand Junction. Among these community leaders were: Leo Prinster (first president of City Market), Al Look (advertising manager for the Daily Sentinel and historian), Clyde Biggs (western Colorado businessman, community leader, and humanitarian), Dr. Jones (dentist who helped Grand Junction become the first municipality in the state to fluoridate the water supply), Dr. Maynard Porter (pioneer dentist), Coe Van Deren (secretary of the School Board, co-owner of several orchards, and a building contractor), Elmer Long (proprietor of E.F. Long Dry Goods store), and Sidney McIntyre (sheepman instrumental in the woolgrowers association as well as serving on the advisory board for the Taylor Grazing Act).

The single family homes in this area display a wide variety of architectural styles, with the majority of the homes constructed in the 1920s and 1930s. Most of the homes have maintained their original architectural integrity, and are of the Bungalow, Craftsman and Vernacular styles. Specific architectural elements include: casement windows, cobblestone foundations, brick walls laid in a precise Flemish bond, porticos with large hip on gable and substantial beams, wide gables with staggered wall beams, well laid, multi-color brickwork, and sun porches. Garages are typically detached structures at the rear of the property. The Lincoln Park School located on the southeast corner of 14<sup>th</sup> Street and Gunnison Avenue was built in 1910 of brick construction with a gable or hip roof. Although there have been several additions to the school throughout the years, the core of the original building remains.

The proposed expansion area includes 58 properties. Petitions indicating approval of the District were signed and returned by owners of 37 of the properties which constitutes 64 percent of the of the properties within the proposed district boundaries. The petitions for expansion of the historic district were circulated by representatives of the Lincoln Park Neighborhood Association.

#### **III. PUBLIC NOTICE**

A Neighborhood Meeting was held on January 25, 2018 consistent with the requirements of Section 21.02.080(g). Nineteen neighbors attended the meeting along with City Staff. The representative for the request noted that historic designation of an expanded district had been identified at a previous meeting as a desirable pursuit for the Lincoln Park Neighborhood Association. Discussion included an overview of the requirements for designation and the benefits of expanding the District as well as

regulations that could be applied if the District chose to adopt guidelines and standards with the designation.

Notice was completed consistent to the provisions in Section 21.02.080(g) of the City's Zoning and Development Code by publication of an advertisement in the Grand Junction Daily Sentinel on March 27, 2018.

#### **IV. ANALYSIS**

Pursuant to Section 21.07.040(f)(2) of the Zoning and Development Code, designation of a District in the City Register of Historic Sites, Structures and Districts shall conform to the following criteria.

A. Nominations/applications for historic district designation shall not be approved unless the application contains written approval from owners of at least 60 percent of the properties within the proposed district boundaries.

The proposed expansion area includes 58 properties. Petitions indicating approval of the District were signed and returned by owners of 37 of the properties which constitutes 64 percent of the of the properties within the proposed district boundaries. Thus, Staff finds this criterion has been met.

B. Historic district boundaries shall be defined by visual changes, historical documentation of different associations or patterns of development, or evidence of changes in site type or site density as established through testing or survey.

The proposed historic district boundaries were established by a combination of factors exhibited in this area. Initial potential boundaries were determined by analysis of the area during the historic survey in the early 1990s. This area included blocks further east as well as south of Grand Avenue. The homes in the blocks east of 15<sup>th</sup> Street have different characteristics since most of the homes in that area are post-World War II (late 1940s and 1950s) in design and character. Additionally, Grand Avenue was determined to be a significant physical barrier in the area and coincides with the boundary between the Lincoln Park and Emerson Park Neighborhood Associations. Staff has found this criterion has been met.

C. The designated contributing sites and structures within the district must be at least 50 years old.

All structures within the proposed district are at least 50 years old, with the majority of homes being constructed in the 1920s and 1930s which makes them between 90 to nearly 100 years old. A few properties date to just after the turn of the century, including the Lincoln Park school constructed in 1910. There are also a few homes that were constructed in the 1940s. Staff finds this criterion has been met.

D. Historic districts shall meet one or more of the following:

#### (1) Architectural

- a. Exemplifies specific elements of an architectural period or style;
- *b.* Is an example of the work of an architect or builder who is recognized for expertise nationally, Statewide, regionally or locally;
- c. Demonstrates superior craftsmanship or high artistic value;
- d. Represents an innovation in construction, materials, or design;
- e. Represents a built environment of a group of people in an era of history;
- f. Is a pattern or a group of elements representing at least one of the above criteria; or
- g. Is a significant historic remodel.

Staff has found the homes within the proposed historic district expansion area exhibit features that meet criterion a. While not in high style, the homes exhibit architectural design and style that exemplify the era – mostly Bungalow, Craftsman and Vernacular styles. Specific architectural elements include: casement windows, cobblestone foundations, brick walls laid in a precise Flemish bond, porticos with large hip on gable and substantial beams, wide gables with staggered wall beams, well laid, multi-color brickwork, and sun porches. These architectural styles and elements are documented in the Historic Building Inventory forms completed for the 1995 survey conducted by the Museum

- (2) Cultural
  - a. Is the site of an historic event that had an effect upon society;
  - b. Exemplifies cultural, political, economic or social heritage of the community; or
  - c. Is associated with a notable person or the work of a notable person.

The growth of this area, east of the original square mile, reflected the prosperous times of the Grand Junction community during the 1920s and 1930s. As previously stated, many of the people who constructed and/or lived in these homes were successful merchants and professionals who played important roles in the history of Grand Junction. Thus, staff find the proposed District meets criteria a. and c. above.

## (3) Geographic/Environmental.

a. Enhances the sense of identity of the community; or

*b.* Is an established and familiar natural setting or visual feature of the community.

The neighborhoods adjacent to Lincoln Park are familiar to the community due to the number of City residents and visitors that utilize the regional park and its facilities. The neighborhoods enhance the overall community character and the residents believe expansion of the historic district will foster community pride and encourage preservation of the historic character of the homes and streetscape in the area. Staff finds the proposed District meets these criteria.

#### V. STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND FINDINGS OF FACT

After reviewing HIS-2018-161, a request to designate an expanded area of the Lincoln Park Historic District in the City Register of Historic Sites, Structures and Districts to include five more blocks adjacent to, and south and east of the existing District, the following findings of fact have been made:

- Consistent with 21.07.040(f)(2)(iii), at least 60 percent of the property owners within the District approve of the designation
- Consistent with 21.07.040(f)(2)(vii), structures within the proposed district are at least 50 years old
- Consistent with 21.07.040(f)(2)(A), structures within the proposed district exemplify specific elements of an architectural style or period
- Consistent with 21.07.040(f)(2)(B), the proposed District eexemplifies cultural, political, economic or social heritage of the community
- Consistent with 21.07.040(f)(2)(C), the proposed district enhances the sense of identity of the community and is an established and familiar feature of the City

Therefore, staff recommends approval of the request to designate an expanded area of the Lincoln Park Historic District in the City Register of Historic Sites, Structures and Districts to include five more blocks adjacent to, and south and east of the existing District

#### **VII. RECOMMENDED MOTION**

Mister Chairman, on the request to designate an expanded area of the Lincoln Park Historic District in the City Register of Historic Sites, Structures and Districts to include five more blocks adjacent to, and south and east of the existing District, HIS-2018-161, I move that the Historic Preservation Board forward a recommendation of approval with the findings of fact listed in the staff report.

## Attachments:

- 1. Site Location Map
- 2. Photographs Characterizing the Proposed Historic District Area





GRAND AVENUE STREETSCAPE





## OURAY AVENUE AND CHIPETA AVENUE STREETSCAPE

# TYPICAL HOMES











LINCOLN PARK SCHOOL