

**Historic Preservation Board Special Meeting**  
Minutes – February 21, 2013

Present: Jon Schler, Jody Motz, Chris Endreson, David Bailey, Michael Menard and Joe Hatfield

Not Present: Jodi Coleman-Niernberg and Kevin Reimer

Also Present: Kristen Ashbeck, City Economic Development and Sustainability; Kathy Portner, Economic Development and Sustainability; Shelly Dackonish, City Attorney; and Scott Petersen, City Planning

The Board convened at 5:00 pm at City Hall.

**Minutes of January 8, 2013 Meeting.** Chris Endreson made a motion to approve the minutes of the January 8, 2013 meeting as written. The motion passed unanimously (6-0) on a second by Michael Menard.

**Hearing – Certificate of Appropriateness Application.** Kristen Ashbeck reviewed the proposal by Stephen E. Hurd for the items outlined below. The current owner has started some work on the carriage house that is in the southeast corner of the property, some of which has already been completed and other work is proposed.

a) An old wooden, barn-style door on the north façade of the carriage house has been replaced with a narrower, modern steel door.

b) A patio area in the yard between the house and the carriage house and a driveway/walkway area between the carriage house and the garage had been paved with bricks. The bricks were removed and concrete was poured in these areas to better divert drainage from the building.

c) There is one existing window at the peak of the east façade of the carriage house. The owner is proposing to add a second vinyl window on the first floor of the east façade.

In addition to the work on the carriage house outlined above, the Certificate of Appropriateness application also includes some site work on the north side of the garage.

a) Pour a concrete walk area along the north side of the garage between the building and the north property line.

b) Replace existing 6-foot wooden privacy fence located at the alley on the north side of the garage with a 6-foot wooden gate.

Kristen then reviewed the pertinent sections of the North Seventh Street Historic Residential District Guidelines and Standards. Per Section III. A. page 4, the primary structure / home on the property at 428 North 7<sup>th</sup> Street is a Contributing Structure. Kristen stated that the *primary structure* is a contributing structure because the inventory states that “contributing” applies to primary structure. Also, language used throughout the Guidelines and Standards address “the view from North 7<sup>th</sup> Street” and the character inventories of the properties do not include features of out buildings. Therefore, Kristen stated that it was staff’s opinion that the intent was that the standards for contributing structures apply only to primary structures, and not to accessory structures, such as the garage and the carriage house that are the subject of this application.

Kristen stated that the Board could find that the intent was to apply the standards for contributing structures to accessory structures, the following standards would apply to the various proposals included in this Certificate of Appropriateness application. If the Board agrees that the intent was that accessory structures are not considered contributing, only the guidelines would apply to the Board’s decision on the

applicant's proposed changes to the garage and the carriage house. The primary structure was designated as contributing on the National Register of Historic Places in 1984, and that National Register list was included in the Guidelines and Standards. In other words, the contributing nature of structures was not revisited at the time of their inclusion in the Guidelines and Standards. Since then, however, the house has been significantly modified.

Doors. Porches, stairs, entries and doors are addressed in Section VII.6., pages 23-24. The guidelines, or suggested treatments for these elements, primarily address front porches on primary buildings and the direction that the primary building faces (towards the street). The Guidelines and Standards do not provide guidelines for accessory buildings facing alleys, such as the carriage house in this application.

If the Board finds that the carriage house is a contributing structure, the following standards addressing door treatments would apply:

- Building entrances shall be maintained in their historical location.
- Doorway materials and design shall be consistent with the architectural style of the building.
- Door cases shall be designed with depth and visual relief.
- Aluminum doors shall not be used.

Windows. Windows are addressed in Section VII.8., pages 25-26. The guidelines, or suggested treatments for windows, include the pattern of windows on a façade and the type and style of window as viewed from North 7<sup>th</sup> Street. Guideline A.9. suggests that multiple window styles should not be used throughout a building. The applicant is proposing that all windows on the carriage house be of the same style and materials by continuing to use vinyl windows as already exist on the building, so this guideline is met by the change to the window on the carriage house.

If the Board finds that the garage and carriage house are contributing structures, the following standards addressing windows would apply:

- Window materials shall be maintained in a historically accurate manner.
- Any alteration of windows shall maintain the historic pattern of their vertical and horizontal rhythms.
- Openings shall not be enlarged, closed off, or otherwise altered in form.

Fencing. Fencing is addressed in Section VI.9., page 13. There are no standards that must be met so the Zoning and Development Code regulations prevail which allow 6-foot privacy fencing in the back yard. The following guidelines are pertinent to this proposal and can be referenced in the Board's decision.

i) *Side and rear yard fences should be a maximum of 6 feet high measured from the street side of the fence. They should be between 60 percent and 100 percent opaque. They may extend to and be placed on property lines.*

The proposal to change rear fencing at the alley on the north side of the garage to a 6-foot privacy gate meets this guideline.

ii) *Chain link, split rail and wire mesh fencing should not be used within the District. The proposed 6-foot wooden privacy gate meets this guideline.*

Landscaping and Parking. There are no guidelines or standards that address the replacement of brick paving with concrete on the site (patio, walkway and parking areas) and the proposed new concrete along

the north side of the garage. The guidelines and standards only address parking for multifamily structures or for non-residential uses. Thus, this kind of property improvement is only subject to the Zoning and Development Code which allows 70 percent of a parcel to be covered with impervious surfaces (buildings plus paved areas). The lot has a landscaped front yard and a grass yard in the middle portion of the lot that will remain. Thus, the proposed site plan that includes the recently-paved areas around the carriage house and the proposed new concrete along the north side of the garage meets this requirement.

Staff Recommendations. Kristen concluded that staff finds that the proposals for all items under consideration meet the applicable North Seventh Street Historic Residential District Guidelines and that the standards for contributing structures do not apply to the carriage house and the garage which are not part of the primary, or contributing, structure.

Chairman Jon Schler then asked if the owner would like to add to staff's presentation. Stephen Hurd stated that he was continuing to improve the property and much of the exterior modification to the buildings on the site had been completed by a previous owner.

Public Hearing. Teddy Jordan and Teddy Jordan, Jr. of 440 North 7<sup>th</sup> Street questioned how items that had already been completed could be approved. It was also stated that there was another window on the carriage house that was behind the old sliding door.

Board Member Discussion. Joe Hatfield stated his understanding of the Guidelines and Standards was that accessory structures were only addressed in guidelines to ensure they remain no taller than, and subordinate to, primary structures. There would also be concern with the use of an accessory structure as to how it impacts neighbors. Joe also stated that in some cases, the secondary structures may actually be more historically significant than the house. Shelly responded that the intent regarding accessory structures must be on what the document actually states rather than what may have been discussed during creation and adoption of the guidelines and standards.

David Bailey showed some examples of solutions for doors on historic carriage houses that would be more appropriate than the door that had already been placed on the carriage house on this property. He stated that the charm and value of a historic home and district is strengthened by maintain the character and integrity of each building. Eventually, as changes occur over time, a building or the entire District may reach a tipping point beyond which the architectural integrity can be recovered.

Jody Motz asked if the new gate next to the garage was going to be wood. Stephen responded that it was to match the wooden privacy fencing.

Joe Hatfield asked if the paved space between the carriage house and the garage was big enough to be a parking space. Kristen responded that it would be evaluated if and when the owner applied for one of the secondary buildings to be used as an accessory dwelling unit.

Jon Schler suggested that the Board and the neighborhood revisit the secondary buildings issue since they are very important to maintaining the integrity of the District.

Actions. The Board then voted on the following motions.

Jody Motz made a motion on item COA-2013-442, an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement of a wooden door with a steel door on the north façade of the carriage house at 428 North 7<sup>th</sup> Street, to approve the proposal as presented. Motion passed 6-0 on a second by David Bailey.

Chris Endreson made a motion on item COA-2013-442, an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of brick cobble with concrete in driveway, patio and walk areas around the carriage house and a new concrete walk area along the north side of the garage at 428 North 7<sup>th</sup> Street, to approve the proposal as presented. Motion passed 6-0 on a second by Michael Menard.

Jody Motz made a motion on item COA-2013-442, an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition of a vinyl window on the first floor of the east façade of the carriage house at 428 North 7<sup>th</sup> Street, to approve the proposal as presented. Motion passed 5-1 on a second by Michael Menard. Joe Hatfield opposed since the structure is listed as a workshop in the historic inventory he did not see the need for an additional window.

Michael Menard made a motion on item COA-2013-442, an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition of a wooden 6-foot privacy gate in an existing 6-foot wooden privacy fence at the alley on the north side of the garage at 428 North 7<sup>th</sup> Street, to approve the proposal as presented. Motion passed 6-0 on a second by Jody Motz.

**Other.** Kristen presented options for identification signs for the North Seventh Street Historic Residential District that had been developed by the City sign shop. The Board selected option D with a few revisions to the type and requested a full-size paper mock-up be presented at the next Board meeting.

The Board will host a booth at the Home Improvement and Remodeling Expo on Sunday, March 3<sup>rd</sup> 10:00-4:00. David Bailey, Jody Motz, Chris Endreson and Kristen Ashbeck will be able to attend in shifts.

Since the special meeting was held so late in the month of February, the Board decided to cancel its regular March meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:15 pm.